

**Subject: DRAFT MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF SECOND PRE NATIONAL BIOETHICS COMMITTEE HELD ON APRIL 18, 2013 AT AGA KHAN UNIVERSITY HOSPITAL KARACHI**

Second Pre National Bioethics Committee meeting was held on April 18, 2013 in the Faculty Office Building of the Aga Khan University, Hospital Karachi. The Additional Secretary, Cabinet Division, Syed Arshad Ali chaired the meeting. The members who attended the meeting are at annexure-A.

1.1. Member/Secretary NBC and Executive Director, PMRC, Dr Huma Qureshi, welcomed the participants of the meeting and presented the progress with particular regard to the decisions taken in the previous meeting (Annexure-B). Members appreciated the progress made so far and emphasized for a continued follow-up till all decisions are implemented.

1.2. Following issues were discussed in details and decisions given:

**1.2.1. Establishment of Provincial PBCs.**

In the context of constitution of provincial bioethics committees, Dr Huma Qureshi briefed the Members that despite letters written by the Cabinet Division and subsequent reminders from PMRC, provinces have not yet responded on this issue. She further informed that to expedite the matter, PMRC has already issued letters to the provincial health Secretaries with a copy to the DG health (who is the focal person for the provincial bioethics committees) to give us a date for training of their teams in this issue. She requested the NBC members to volunteer to make themselves available as trainers for the provincial training as and when required. She also informed that the executive committee (EC) of PMRC had suggested that in case of non response from the health secretaries, the provincial Chief Secretaries may be approached for facilitation. The Chair agreed to the suggestion of the EC and said that he will contact the Provincial Chief Secretaries and hopefully solve this issue.

**Decision: The Additional Secretary, Cabinet Division will contact the Provincial Chief Secretaries regarding constitution of provincial bioethics committees.**

**Secretariat to send a tentative training program in a week to the NBC members so that they may choose their subject**

### **1.2.2. Nomination of representative from PMDC**

The Member Secretary informed the committee that letters were written to PM&DC for the nomination of a representative in place of Dr Nadeem Akbar who is currently not working with the Council, but there has been no response so far. She said that the hierarchy of the PM&DC has been dissolved and we may have to wait till June 2013. Dr Farhat Moazam said that the PM&DC representative should also be the part of Medical Ethics Committee because his inputs are essentially required on the development of guidelines and materials for the training of medical and dental practitioners on medical ethics and for the implementation of the decisions taken by the MEC. Dr Moazam informed the Chair that she also wrote letters to the president PM&DC but no response has been received. She said that MEC has held 02 Meetings one on 18<sup>th</sup> February 2013 and other on 12<sup>th</sup> March 2013 at CBEC, SIUT, Karachi, but there was no representation from PM & DC and the Director General Health ,Sindh. The members showed their concern on the non-serious attitude of PM&DC and requested the Chair to help resolve the issue.

**Decision: The Cabinet Division shall write a letter to the Administrator PM&DC to nominate a person**

### **1.2.3. Replacement of NBC members-CVs for non ex officio members invited**

As most NBC members have completed eight years, and have two more years to go therefore CVs have been invited from both public and private institutions for the non ex officio membership. Dr Huma informed that so far 34 CVs have been received of which 8 applied for category of bioscientists, 04 for academia and 05 Social sciences. However, 17 CVs did not mention the category and they have been approached to indicate the same. On the query of Dr Farhat Moazam about the selection process from the CVs, it was informed full plus one page CV of all candidates is circulated to all NBC members (according to the category). The applicant is chosen by majority

recommending him/her. The Members agreed to the selection process and suggested to give a final date to the institutions for the submission of CVs and then process these immediately.

**Decision: The last date for the receipt of CVs should be 30<sup>th</sup> April and the Secretariat should circulate the CVs to all NBC members in the first or second week of May 2013.**

1.3. The Member Secretary informed the NBC Members that PMRC shared the progress with their Executive Committee in the meeting held on 08 April 2013. The EC gave the following suggestions:

- CVs and one page profile of NBC members should be available on NBC website
- NBC to give endorsement to IRBs and monitor their progress

The Members appreciated the suggestion of the Executive Committee and agreed to provide one pager profile for placement on NBC Website. However, they recommended that only PMRC administrative and budgetary issues be shared with the Executive Committee and not the NBC as NBC is not under PMRC but it is a separate entity.

**Decision: PMRC will discuss administrative and budgetary issues with the Executive Committee and not the NBC issues**

#### **1.4. Research Ethics Committee Progress.**

Dr Huma presented the progress regarding Research Ethics Committee. The Members appreciated the performance of REC and recommended that in future number of times that a project was revised should also be informed. The Chair agreed to this proposal.

**Decision:** The NBC Secretariat will present the said information in future

#### **1.5. Medical Ethic Committee Progress**

Dr Farhat Moazam, Chairperson Medical Ethics Committee briefed the Members on the progress and issues of MEC:

#### **1.5.1. Progress**

- Two meetings of the Medical Ethics Committee were held at the Centre of Biomedical Ethics and Culture (CBEC) of the Sindh Institute of Urology and Transplantation in Karachi.
- TORs drafted and approved by the MEC
- Third MEC meeting is scheduled for 21st May 2013

#### **1.5.2. Issues**

- National representation is required on MEC both from provincial focal persons and PM&DC.
- Agreement that committee be named the more inclusive Healthcare Ethics Committee (HCEC) in view of its scope and functions
- Agreement on incorporating clinical ethics sessions in NBC workshops to train trainers. NBC Secretariat will facilitate in the training process.

The Chair and the members appreciated the efforts of Dr Farhat Moazam and the following decisions were made:

#### **Decisions**

- **Dr Farhat Moazam and Dr Aasim shall share the list of bioethics diploma holders and postgraduates with the MEC so that some of them can be co-opted as the Provincial members**
- **The name proposed for MEC i.e. Healthcare Ethics Committee (HCEC) will be finalized in the next NBC meeting as it come in the preview of the NBC**

- **The NBC Secretariat will help incorporate the clinical ethics session in the workshops to train trainers. Dr Farhat Moazam will provide the material for training and names of the facilitators in advance.**

#### **1.6. Next NBC Meeting:**

The next NBC meeting is due therefore the Dr Huma requested the Chair to get an appropriate time and date from the secretary cabinet.

**Decision: The Additional Secretary, Syed Arshad Ali will discuss this issue with the Cabinet Secretary.**

In the concluding remarks the Additional Secretary, Cabinet Division, Syed Arshad Ali appreciated the efforts made by the Committee and assured that the Cabinet Division will take full ownership of the National Bioethics Committee and go all out to take the NBC agenda forward

## **Annexure-A**

### **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

1. Dr. Huma Qureshi, Executive Director, Member/ Secretary NBC, Pakistan Medical Research Council (PMRC) Shahrah-e-Jamhuriat, Sector G-5/2, Islamabad.
2. Dr. Farhat Moazam, Professor and Chairperson, Centre of Biomedical Ethics & Culture (CBEC), Sindh Institute of Urology and Transplantation (SIUT) Karachi
3. Prof. Dr. Aasim Ahmad, Professor / Chief Nephrologist, the Kidney Centre, Karachi.
4. Mr. Shaukat Ali Jawaid, Editor In Chief, Pakistan Journal of Medical Sciences & Pulse International, Karachi.
5. Dr Farid Khan, Nominee of Pharma industry, Karachi.
6. Dr Muhammad Arif Munir, Principal Research officer PMRC (Co-opted Member)