

Healthcare Ethics Committee (HCEC) of NBC
Tuesday, August 12, 2014, 9.00 am to 11.00 am (Meeting # 7)

Venue: CBEC-SIUT, Karachi

Present: Haroon Ahmed (HA), Aamir Jafarey (AJ), Shaukat Jawaid (SJ), Abdul Ghani (AG), Farhat Moazam (FM), Saima Pervaiz Iqbal (SPI)

Regret: Dr. Farid Khan (FK), Aasim Ahmed (AA), Asma Humayun (AH)

Minutes: by FM

1) Review of February 11 meeting minutes, and matters arising:

Minutes were reviewed and approved as such. Members had completed all tasks assigned to them.

2) Report of Peshawar NBC meeting, August 7, 2014:

FM informed the group that this was, admirably, the third consecutive time NBC has met as scheduled. (As always, the Health Secretary or a representative failed to show up to chair the meeting). She briefed members about discussions relevant to HCEC.

- a) NBC members, including Dr. Dad representative from Baluchistan, enthusiastically endorsed the November Ethics Workshop in Quetta (in the week beginning Nov. 11), and recommended that the next NBC meeting should be held there at the same time. FM said that HCEC members should finalize the dates and content of workshop sessions in today's meeting.
- b) Following her report about HCEC progress with the ethics guidelines for undergraduate curriculums, NBC members suggested that once ready, the document should be circulated to NBC for discussion in one of its future meetings.
- c) The continuing, and frustrating, absence of PMDC representatives from meetings was again discussed in NBC. Dr. Hafizullah, VC of KMU and member of PMDC executive committee, who was present offered to take this up personally with the PMDC president. He also promised to try and have someone attend this HCEC meeting (in which he has obviously failed). Whether Dr. Hafizullah will eventually have any success in his efforts remains to be seen.

3) HCEC Ethics Workshop in Quetta, November 2014:

With the DG Health Balochistan installed in office again, members discussed the proposed two day workshop – sessions and content - in detail using the rough grid AJ had prepared (attached). It was decided that the dates will be Thursday Nov. 13 for the NBC meeting while Nov. 14 and 15 will be utilized for the workshop which will cover the basics of both research and clinical ethics. FM asked AG to review the suggested topics and suggest other areas that may be relevant. AG stated that it may be difficult to have participants stay on until late afternoon so it was decided to end teaching sessions at 2.00 pm to be followed by lunch.

HCEC members noted that Baluchistan PBC members are all from Quetta. Similarly the institutions which the DG has suggested (list sent to FM earlier) should be contacted to nominate workshop participants are also all located in Quetta. It was believed important that PBC composition and those invited for the workshop be more inclusive of other regions in Baluchistan, something that was also touched upon in the Peshawar NBC meeting. SJ pointed out that the TA/DA for workshop participants from outside Quetta is not provided by NBC Secretariat. AG said that these institutions must be informed that they are responsible for covering these costs.

FM stated that Dr. Farooq (present in Lahore NBC meeting) and Dr. Dad (who attended the NBC meeting in Peshawar) appear to be the representatives of DG Health Baluchistan for organizing the workshop. She said that AG will continue to act as the liaison between them in Quetta and HCEC in Karachi as and when needed, and will copied all her relevant email correspondence.

Decisions and Tasks:

** Ethics workshop dates are confirmed for November 14 and 15 (with NBC meeting on November 13).

** AJ and FM will fine tune the ethics workshop details over the next several days and update HCEC members. Members are welcome to email them any suggestions they may have.

** AG will meet with Dr. Farooq and Dr. Dad in Quetta to brief them about the discussion in today's meeting and keep in contact with FM about progress.

** FM will email Drs. Dad and Farooq, with copies to NBC Secretariat and AG, about decisions taken today.

** FM will request the Secretariat to circulate confirmed dates of workshop (and concomitant NBC meeting) to NBC members as soon as possible, and to begin working on the logistics of venue, travel accommodation, etc. with relevant people in Quetta.

4) Ethics Guidelines for Medical/Dental Undergraduate Curriculum:

The most recent draft of the text – Guidelines and accompanying Handbook – was discussed. Whether the document should recommend “number of hours” for teaching ethics was discussed again. In view of the significant diversity of curricular content and how it is taught in different Pakistani colleges most believed that it is not possible to suggest a fixed number of hours. The consensus was to only recommend the *minimum* time (50 hours) utilized for ethics education during the five years.

SJ mentioned a few changes in his section on Scientific Misconduct and these were incorporated. HA stated that the section on Mental Health in the Handbook was missing important resource material and did not “reflect” the stated objectives. He would email FM references, additional cases, and important definitions that should be incorporated. FM also pointed out that the Handbook did not include references and cases for some of the sections and these should be added.

It was agreed that once finalized, the document draft will be circulated to NBC members for review and discussion. Frustration was again expressed at the lack of any input from PMDC in formulating the document especially as PMDC is critical for circulation to, and acceptance of the guidelines by the medical and dental colleges of the country.

Decisions and Tasks:

- ** HA will email additional material (references, cases, and definitions) by Saturday, August 16.
- ** FM and AJ will go over the Handbook and add references and cases where needed.
- ** SPI was requested to provide 2-3 references each for the Handbook for the following - Clinical Ethics Sections 7 (euthanasia), 8 (HIV, STD), and 9 (Resource Allocation); and for Public Health Section 16.
- ** Once modified, AJ will circulate the document to HCEC members for final approval. It can then be circulated to NBC for review and discussion.

5) AOB:

The next HCEC meeting will tentatively take place in January 2015 on a date to be confirmed later.

Introduction to Research and Clinical Ethics: Workshop for Baluchistan Bioethics Committee Members Quetta, November 13 to 15, 2014		
THU 13th NOV	FRI 14th NOV Research Ethics	SAT 15th NOV Clinical Ethics
9.00 am to 12.00 noon NBC Meeting	9.00 am to 10.00 am Introduction to bioethics	9.00 am to 10.00 am Clinical informed consent, disclosure, conflicts with families
	10.00 am to 11.30 am Common concepts in research ethics	10.00 am to 11.00 am Plagiarism and scientific misconduct
12.00 noon to 12.15 pm Tea	11.30 am to 12.00 noon Tea	11.00 am to 11.15 am Tea
12.15 pm to 2.00 pm NBC Pakistan, Objectives and TOR of Provincial Bioethics Committees HQ/FM	12.00 noon to 1.00 pm Ethical review process	11.15 am to 1.00 pm Case discussion
	1.00 pm to 2.00 pm Case discussion	
2.00 pm Lunch		
Dr. Farhat Moazam - FM		
Dr. Huma Qureshi - HQ		