Final Minutes

1st Quarterly National Bioethics Committee (NBC)Meeting February 6, 2020: Conference Room Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination, (NHSR&C) Islamabad.

The 1st Quarterly National Bioethics Committee (NBC) meeting was held on February 6, 2020; in Conference Room Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination, (NHSR&C) Islamabad at 3:30 pm. The meeting was chaired by Dr. Zafar Mirza, Special Assistant to Prime Minister, Ministry of National Health Services Regulation & Coordination(NHSR&C)/ Patron NBC.

Following members attended the meeting.

- 1. Dr. Zafar Mirza, Special Assistant to Prime Minister, Ministry of NHSR&C/Patron NBC.
- 2. Dr. Malik Muhammad Safi, Director General Ministry for NHSR&C/Vice Chairperson NBC.
- 3. Maj. General Aamir Ikram, **Executive Director PHRC**/Secretary NBC.
- 4. Prof. Farhat Moazam, Center of Biomedical Ethics and Culture, Karachi. Chairperson HCEC
- 5. Dr. Saima Pervez Iqbal, Associate Professor, Shifa College of Medicine, Islamabad. **Chairperson REC**
- 6. Prof. Dr. Shoaib Shafi, Senior Vice President, Nominee President CPSP, Islamabad.
- 7. Dr. Qibla Ayaz, Chairman, Council of Islamic Ideology, Islamabad.
- 8. Prof. Dr. Jamshed Akhtar, professor and Head of the Department of pediatric Surgery, NICH, Karachi.
- 9. Dr. Aamir Mustafa Jafarey, Centre for Biomedical Ethics and Culture, Karachi.
- 10. Dr. Bager Hasnain Jafri, Representative WHO, Islamabad.
- 11. Prof. Dr. Munir A. Saleemi, University of Lahore.
- 12. Dr. Asim Rauf, Chief Executive Officer, Drug Regulatory Authority Pakistan (DRAP), Islamabad.
- 13. Dr. Masud Ur Rehman, Additional Director, Drug Regulatory Authority Pakistan (DRAP), Islamabad.
- 14. Dr. Amjad Hussain, Representative HEC, Islamabad.
- 15. Dr. Fauzia Mushtaq, Registrar, Pakistan Nursing Council (PNC), Islamabad.
- 16. Dr. Aftab Hussain, DGH Services, Muzaffarabad AJK.
- 17. Dr. Tahir Bashir-ud-Din Khilji, Additional Director DGHS Office, Focal Person, DGHS Peshawar.
- 18. Dr. Salman Ahmed Tipu, Vice Dean, Isra University, Islamabad.
- 19. Dr. Manzar Anwar Khan, Khyber College of Dentistry, Peshawar.
- 20. Mr. Abdul Ghani Sasoli, Institute of Public Health (IPH), Quetta.
- 21. Dr. Farkhanda Ghafoor, Ex-Principle Research Officer, PHRC.
- 22. Dr. Nighat Murad, Research Director/Focal Person NBC Pakistan Health Research Council, Islamabad.
- 23. Dr. Faiza Bashir, Coordinator NBC, Pakistan Health Research Council, Islamabad.

Members who sent their regrets to the NBC Secretariat prior to meeting.

- 1. Maj. Gen. Imran Fazal, Nominee Surgeon General Pakistan Army, Rawalpindi.
- 2. Dr. Ambreen Munir, LUMHS, Jamshoro.
- 3. Dr. Aftab Ahmed Qazi, Focal Person, Directorate General Health Services (DGHS) Office, Hyderabad Sindh.
- 4. Dr. Shahid Mehmood, Representative Director General Health, Baluchistan Quetta.
- 5. Dr. Abdul Majeed, Secretary PBC Punjab/Representative (DGHS) Punjab, Lahore.

Members who were absent.

- 1. Dr. Tariq Mehmood Mian, President of Pakistan Association of Family Physicians
- 2. President, Supreme Court Bar Association, Islamabad.
- 3. Chairman PPMA, Islamabad.
- 4. President, Pakistan Medical Commission (PMC) old PM&DC, Islamabad.

Dr. Zafar Mirza Special Assistant to Prime Minister, Ministry of NHSR&C/ Patron NBC; welcomed the Members which was followed by the introduction of the Members.

Agenda Item-1: Briefing on the actions taken on the decisions of the last NBC meeting.

The members were briefed about the NBC activities along with the status of the actions taken in the last NBC meeting held in AJK on 8th September 2018.

Agenda Item-2: Approval of the minutes of the last NBC meeting.

The member Secretary informed that the minutes of the meeting held in Muzaffarabad AJK on 8th September 2018 were circulated to all attending members and after incorporating their comments the minutes were circulated to all members and no further comments have been received. The members unanimously approved the minutes.

Decision: Minutes were approved.

It was briefed to the chairperson that owing to reorganization of PHRC the NBC is halted in its processes. Its fate must be decided and clearly strengthened as a body of Ministry.

Agenda Item-3:Bioethics Curriculum

The curriculum developed by NBC for teaching Bioethics in medical colleges is developed since three years but is not implemented. PMDC must be directed to make it a formal curriculum part as it's a pending decision for three years now.

Agenda item 4: Fast tract Review Process at NBC-REC for covid related research:

In wake of Covid pandemic it is anticipated that research will be eminent need. NBC was advised by the Chairperson to develop process to ensure ethical compliance. The Chairperson REC informed that REC plans to initiate the Rapid Turn-around Review (RTR) of Covid related studies with in 72 hours. It was greatly appreciated and any help from SAPM required was welcomed.

Agenda Item 5: Concerns of NBC Members:

As this was an extraordinary meeting after two years members were apprehensive about the NBC. They posed certain proposals via Dr Farhat Moazzam as under

- 1. What is the fate of regular meeting of NBC
- 2. Elected members tenure has expired soEx-post facto approval all for extension in tenure for members.
- 3. As all processes are at halt in NBC owing to reorganization of PHRC it was proposed that to maintain continuity in REC review process extended terms for existing members should be approved.
- 4. Induction of new members process shall also be initiated at the same time.
- 5. Institutional responsibilities with regards to the role of ethics or bioethics must be very clearly defined eg
 - a. Clinical Trials approval by DRAP.
 - b. Direct communication of NBC and DRAP needs to be on regular basis for clinical trials
 - c. Regulations of clinical trials by NBC and DRAP a clear line of action and information to the researchers.
- 6. Regulations and guidelines should be developed for Medical negligence and malpractice SAPM further added that NBC should also
 - a. Involve Provincial Bioethics Committee to enhance their working and start collaborative process of approval
 - b. Formulization of these bodies
 - c. Train them future in health and allied health who are properly trained in ethics in Health
 - d. Set standards at national level for training and research
 - e. Co-opt members for review

All the above proposals were agreed to and approved by SAPM and ED PHRC was directed to ensure compliance along with all stakeholders.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks.

(Prof. Dr. Saima Perwaiz Iqbal)

Chairperson

NBC-Research Ethics Committee